## **Alternative Development Pathways for Seaweed Aquaculture**

## **Barry Antonio Costa-Pierce**

Ecological Aquaculture International, LLC <u>bcp@oceanfoods.org</u>

Professor II (20%) Faculty of Biosciences & Aquaculture Nord University Bodø, Norway <u>barry.costa-pierce@nord.no</u>



Honorary Doctorate (Doctor Honoris Causa) in Science Faculty of Science University of Gothenburg

Ecological Aquaculture International

https://oceanfoods.org



SWEMARC SWEDISH MARICULTURE RESEARCH CENTER





Accepted: 10 April 2023

DOI: 10.1111/jwas.12977

#### EDITORIAL



## A decadal outlook for global aquaculture

Mair, G.C., Halwart, M., Derun, Y., and B.A. Costa-Pierce (2023). A decadal outlook for global aquaculture. *Journal of the World Aquaculture Society* 54(2): 196-205. https://doi.org/10.1111/jwas.12977

Costa-Pierce, B.A. and T. Chopin (2021). The hype, fantasies and realities of aquaculture development globally and in its new geographies. *World Aquaculture* 52 (2): 23-35.





# **Inconvenient blue foods facts**

- I. Asia dominates in every way...**STILL** 89%
- II. China is the world's leader..... STILL 58%
- III. Most is freshwater..... STILL 62%

China "OLD Geographies"	18.5 (57.1)
Indonesia	9.3 (28.8)
Republic of Korea	1.7 (5.3)
Philippines	1.5 (4.6)
Democratic People's Republic of Korea	0.5 (1.7)
Japan	0.4 (1.2)
Malaysia	0.2 (0.5)
China - Taiwan	0.1 (0.2)
Vietnam	0.0 (0.1)
Total Asian seaweed production	32.2 (99.5)
Zanzibar, United Republic of Tanzania	0.1 (0.3)
Chile	0.0 (0.1)
Other producers in the world	0.1 (0.1)
Total world seaweed production	32.4 (100)

Saccharina japonica (kombu)	11.4
<i>Eucheuma</i> spp.	9.4
Oysters	5.8
Penaeus vannamei (whiteleg shrimp)	5.0
Ruditapes philippinarum (Manila clam)	4.1
Gracilaria spp.	3.4
<i>Porphyra/Pyropia</i> spp. (nori)	2.9
Salmo salar (Atlantic salmon)	2.4
Undaria pinnatifida (wakame)	2.3
Scallops	1.9
Kappaphycus spp.	1.6
Mussels	1.6
Sinovovacula constricta (Chinese razor clam)	0.9
Penaeus monodon (giant tiger prawn)	0.8
Anadara granosa (blood cockle)	0.4
Sargassum spp.	0.3
Apostichopus japonicus (Japanese sea cucumber)	0.2
Numbers are in million metric tons live weight (FAO 2020); brok seaweeds in brown font, red seaweeds in red font.	wn





## **New Geographies – North America and Europe**

>90% of the seaweeds harvested annually from North America and Europe are from

**SEAWEED FISHERIES**, not aquaculture

China "New Geographies"	18.5 (57.1)
Indonesia	9.3 (28.8)
Republic of Korea	1.7 (5.3)
Philippines	1.5 (4.6)
Democratic People's Republic of Korea	0.5 (1.7)
Japan	0.4 (1.2)
Malaysia	0.2 (0.5)
China - Taiwan	0.1 (0.2)
Vietnam	0.0 (0.1)
Total Asian seaweed production	32.2 (99.5)
Zanzibar, United Republic of Tanzania	0.1 (0.3)
Chile	0.0 (0.1)
Other producers in the world	0.1 (0.1)
Total world seaweed production	32.4 (100)

### LH Harvesting areas in Norway



from Marine Biopolymers proposal to Iceland (2020)

## Total laminaria hyperborea harvesting Norway



Figure 1. County quantity harvested (in thousand tonnes) of kelp (Laminaria hyperborea) in the period 1985-2013.



From Marine Biopolymers proposal to Iceland (2020)





## Thorverk Ltd. Reykhólar, Iceland

Breidafjördur fjord - harvest wild Ascophyllum nodosum (rockweed) and Laminaria digitata (oar kelp).

95% of Thorverk's products are exported (dried seaweed meal)

Most of Reykhólar's ~120 people are employed by the seaweed factory



#### Institute Marine Research





#	Area	Estimated Biomass (MT)	Surveyed Biomass to Date (MT)
3	Tröllaskagi survey 1 (2019) 125,000		125,000
4	Flatey (2020)	287,000*	191,800
5	Tjornes (2020)	111,000	109,500
6/7	Sletta Vest/Astur (2021)	550,000	**
8	Pistilfjordour/Langanes West (2021)	389,000	**
3	Tröllaskagi survey 2 (2021)	165,000	**
2	Skagi (2021)	173,000	**
1	Vatnsnes (2021)	400,000	**
	TOTAL	2,200,000	



# **Seaweed Fisheries** in North America...



## **Seaweed Fisheries** in North America...







# Fantasy – Quick Fix for Climate?

Carbon - "Sequestration" Methane - Cattle Burbs and Farts



Krause-Jensen, D. & Duarte, C. (2016) Substantial role of macroalgae in marine carbon sequestration. *Nature Geoscience* 9

Krause-Jensen, D. et al. (2018). Sequestration of macroalgal carbon: the elephant in the Blue Carbon room. *Biol. Lett*. 14: 20180236.



Costa-Pierce, B.A. and T. Chopin. 2021. The hype, fantasies and realities of aquaculture development globally and in its new geographies. *World Aquaculture* 52 (2): 23-35.

Gallagher, J.B. et al. (2021). Missing the forest for the trees: Do seaweed ecosystems mitigate atmospheric  $CO_2$  emissions? bioRxiv doi: 10.1101/2021.09.05.459038

Troell et al. (2022). Farming the Ocean – Seaweeds as a Quick Fix for the Climate? *Reviews in Fisheries Science & Aquaculture* doi: 10.1080/23308249.2022.2048792

Chopin et al. (2024). Deep-ocean seaweed dumping for carbon sequestration: Questionable, risky, and not the best use of valuable biomass. *One Earth* (2024), https://doi.org/10.1016/j.oneear.2024.0 1.013





## TABLE 1. Extrapolated ecosystem services from 500 million tons (dry weight) of seaweeds.

Ocean area required	500,000 km <sup>2</sup>	Based on average annual yield of 1,000 dry tons/km <sup>2</sup> undert current best practice. Equals 0.03% of the ocean surface area.
Protein for people and animals	50,000,000 tons	Assumes average protein content of 10% dry weight. Estimated value \$28 billion. Could completely replace fishmeal in animal feeds.
Algal oil for people and animals	15,000,000 tons	Assumes average lipid content of 3% dry weight. Estimated value \$23 billion Could completely replace fish oil in animal feeds.
Nitrogen removal	10,000,000 tons	Assumes nitrogen content 2% of dry weight. Equals 18% of the nitrogen added to oceans through fertilizer.
Phosphorous removal	1,000,000 tons	Assumes phosphorous content 0.2% of dry weight. Represents 61% of the phosphorous input as fertilizer.
Carbon assimilation	135,000,000 tons	Assumes carbon content 27% of dry weight. Equals 6% of the carbon added annually to oceans from greenhouse gas emissions.
Bioenergy potential	1,250,000,000 MWH	Assumes 50% carbohydrate content, converted to energy. Equals 1% of annual global energy use.
Land sparing	1,000,000 km²	Assumes 5 tons/ha average farm yield. Equals 6% of global cropland.
Freshwater sparing	500 km <sup>3</sup>	Assumes agricultural use averages 1 m <sup>3</sup> water/kg biomass. Equals 14% of annual global freshwater withdrawals.

# "Only" 0.03% of ocean space



18% of N as fertilizers 61% of P as fertilizers 6% of C added to oceans 1% of global energy use Spares 6% global cropland Spares 14% of global water withdrawls



# **Big! 500,000 km<sup>2</sup> Dry to WW 5-10X 2.5 to 5 million km<sup>2</sup>**



# Dry ~Size of Spain or France ~Size of All Canada's Agricultural Lands

Wet ~Size of Australia

#### A climate savior?

To help solve the climate crisis, some companies want to create enormous seaweed farms in the open ocean that could draw carbon dioxide (CO<sub>2</sub>) from the atmosphere without consuming fresh water or land. Carbon trapped in the seaweed would then be sunk to the ocean floor. Skeptics, however, contend that the process may not capture as much carbon as some imagine and could cause ecological mayhem.

#### Farming for carbon

As it grows, seaweed sucks CO<sub>2</sub> from seawater. If that water stays close to the surface, it can draw CO<sub>2</sub> from the air into the ocean.

CO<sub>2</sub> (gas)

#### CO<sub>2</sub> (aqueous)

Carbon-depleted water

#### Into the deep

CO is only exchanged between the air and water at the ocean's surface. If the carbon-depleted water sinks too quickly, less CO will be pulled from the atmosphere and some of the carbon benefits from seaweed farming will be missed.

> Subducted seawater can't equilibrate carbon with the atmosphere.

#### Deep-sea unknowns

Dumping seaweed on the ocean floor could keep carbon trapped for centuries as decay slows and deep currents hold water far from the surface. But it could have unknown effects on deep-sea ecosystems that evolved with a paucity of organic matter.



Hurd et al. (2023). Air-sea carbon dioxide equilibrium: Will it be possible to use seaweeds for carbon removal offsets? *J. Phycology*. 2023;00:1–11.

Cornwall, W. (2024) Science 385(6712):924-927.

Sinking seaweed bundles

weed farm

Decomposing seaweed

Deep-sea anîmaki

Seaweed

particles

**Carbon** leak

Bits of solid and dissolved

seaweed are shed as the

Research suggests much

break down when eaten by organisms, releasing

plants grow and decay.

of that material might

CO<sub>2</sub> and undermining seaweed's value for sequestering carbon.

#### Law of Conservation of Mass

"Nothing is lost, nothing is created, everything is transformed." Antoine-Laurent de Lavoisier (1743-1794)



Choy, C.A. et al. (2017). Deep pelagic food web structure as revealed by in situ feeding observations. *Proceedings of the Royal Society B*. 284: 20172116, doi: 10.1098/rspb.2017.2116



# For Nearshore Oceans It's NITROGEN

# "The forgotten element of CLIMATE CHANGE"







# Asparagopsis taxiformis




"Burps contribute ~2 billion tonnes of  $CO_2$ eq/year...more than 4% of all greenhouse emissions globally. By the end of this decade, we will be growing enough of our seaweed to supplement all 100 million cattle in the US, all on a plot of land that is smaller than **Chicago's O'Hare airport (7200 acres)**"



Kinley et al. (2016) Experiments done *in vitro* (in artificial rumens) not in vivo. There was no real **cow rumen** absorbing one gram of the red seaweed Asparagopsis taxiformis



**Bromoform** is the halogenated compound that reduces enteric methane emissions in cows.

In experiments with real cows -

\*Animals regularly refused the feed or selected against *Asparagopsis* 

\*Cows rumen walls showed inflammation

Bromoform residues have been found in cow urine & milk

Muizelaar et al. (2021). Safety and transfer study: Transfer of bromoform present in *Asparagopsis taxiformis* to milk and urine of lactating dairy cows. *Foods 10*(3),584 <u>https://doi.org/10.3390/foods10030584</u>

Algal Research 64 (2022) 102673



Contents lists available at ScienceDirect

```
Algal Research
```

journal homepage: www.elsevier.com/locate/algal

Review article

Benefits and risks of including the bromoform containing seaweed *Asparagopsis* in feed for the reduction of methane production from ruminants

Christopher R.K. Glasson<sup>a</sup>, Robert D. Kinley<sup>b</sup>, Rocky de Nys<sup>c</sup>, Nick King<sup>d</sup>, Serean L. Adams<sup>d</sup>, Michael A. Packer<sup>d</sup>, Johan Svenson<sup>d</sup>, Charles T. Eason<sup>d, 1, 2</sup>, Marie Magnusson<sup>a,\*</sup>





<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>a</sup> University of Waikato, Te Aka Mātuatua - School of Science, Environmental Research Institute, Tauranga 3110, New Zealand

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>b</sup> Commonwealth Scientific and Industrial Research Organisation (CSIRO), Agriculture and Food, Townsville, QLD 4811, Australia

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>c</sup> James Cook University, Centre for Macroalgal Resources and Biotechnology, and College of Science and Engineering, Townsville, QLD 4811, Australia

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>d</sup> Cawthron Institute, Nelson 7010, New Zealand

A. taxiformis (and A. armata) are small red seaweeds, not ubiquitous, and have complex life histories. They can be produced with great care in academic settings...but not be easy to produce at the large biomass levels necessary to feed a **global cattle population ~1 billion head (2020)** 

~ 60% of the world's cattle are not in feedlots but ranched in free-range pastures where they are encountered infrequently, mainly when counted or branded.

Even in countries where feedlots are common, cattle normally remain in a feedlot for **only 3-5 months of their 36-month average production cycle.** 

Costa-Pierce, B.A. and T. Chopin. 2021. The hype, fantasies and realities of aquaculture development globally and in its new geographies. *World Aquaculture* 52 (2): 23-35.





Can we now all eat guilt-free burgers" ??



Scale is one of the most controversial aspects of aquaculture today Scaling issues play a central role in the political and regulatory obstacles to advancing aquaculture Most aquaculture development occurs in rural areas SCALING OUT, NOT ONLY UP <

Frontiers Research Topic (frontiersin.org) 82 authors in 10 articles

Barry Antonio Costa-Pierce, USA & PORTUGAL Helgi Thor Thorarensen, NORWAY Åsa Strand, SWEDEN

"Ocean/Aquatic Food Systems: Interactions with Ecosystems, Fisheries, Aquaculture, and People"

## FOUR RECURRING THEMES

"Promotion of diverse aquaculture scales may allow development of new ecological and social synergies for smaller farms to achieve economic viability at regional scales"

# **#1 IMPORT SUBSTITUTION**

U.S. farm harvests only ~454,000 kg (2019)

Imports **8.6 million kg** edible seaweeds from Asia >50% from China, South Korea

New Markets **New Technology** 

## **Market-Driven Technology Development**

**Existing Markets** 



Appropriate Technology Development

# Edible Seaweed Market Analysis



Growing and harvesting the primary farmed edible seaweed species (sugar/skinny kelp and alaria) is a relatively low cost, easily implementable process that can deliver supplemental revenue and asset utilization. For most harvesters that lack processing capabilities, edible seaweed provides supplemental revenue rather than their primary source of revenue.

The annual revenue potential for harvesters varies significantly depending on lease acreage and processing practices. Harvesters without processing capabilities can expect to realize approximately \$0.40 – \$0.70 per wet pound for bulk unprocessed seaweed. For these harvesters, securing access to processing capabilities prior to initiating the growing process, either via established contracts with processors or investing in first stage processing (typically drying) capabilities, is critical to success. Maine infrastructure requirements to support continued growth include:

- Expanded processing capacity
- Value-added product development
- Distribution network expansion
- Brand building/consumer awareness





# Atlantic Sea Farms

Successful "Scaling Out" Model of Seaweed Farming – most ~2 ha

\*27 independent ASF partner farmers, primarily fishing families who already have boats/gear
\*Trains/Provides free seed/Contracts to buy harvests
Make US\$ 40,000 to \$110,000/season as

supplemental income



# #2 Community Scale

"Grant cycles live and die. Business doesn't. The world is ready for seaweed. It doesn't need to be subsidized."

Brianna Warner CEO Atlantic Sea Farms

## #3 PARTNERSHIPS WITH APPLIED ACADEMIA Science Based DESIGN CRITERIA...SURVIVABLE, SOPHISTICATED ENGINEERING BUT VERY LOW COST

- Minimalist approach to gear
  - low capital...use existing fishing assets
  - highly mobile
  - easily deployed
  - easily permitted
- Submerged technology
- No conflicts with the "fishing/tourism summers"
- Cash on harvests
- High education value = easy tech transfer

# **Design Charette**

Transdisciplinary - Formed a Ecological Engineering, Social-Ecological Research Team

## OLD - Dead Weight Moorings, Vertical Mooring Line Design



- Expensive Moorings
- Cumbersome to Deploy
- Permanent Installation
- Large Buoys
- Slack System
- Requires Large Boats = \$\$





#### **Cross Section**



#### Overhead





# Farm in a Box

200' (66 m) culture lines 18' (6 m) Maritime Skiff Crew of 2...Total deployment time < 0.5 hour

Mobile gear all removed during high fishing season

Supplies and materials - <u>All locally available and</u> familiar to commercial fisheries

### Total cost < \$600 REUSABLE

- Five Years of Success
- Cash on harvests...

kg wet wt/line ~15-16 kg/m of Sugar Kelp

Produces ~ 1000

High education value = Easy tech transfer











# Farm in a Truck



b) Anchor leg components



Anchor leg components

- 1. (4) 1" nylon at 20 ft Load-cell lines
- 2. (4) 1" nylon at 75 ft Anchor lines
- 3. (4) 5/8" longlink chain at 50 ft
- 4. (4) 110# claw anchor



ORIGINAL RESEARCH published: 23 February 2022 doi: 10.3389/fsuts.2022.848035



#### **OPEN ACCESS**

#### Edited by:

Sudhakar Srivastava, Banaras Hindu University, India

#### Reviewed by:

Mark Flaherty, University of Victoria, Canada Tim Gray, Newcastle University, United Kingdom

### Engineering A Low-Cost Kelp Aquaculture System for Community-Scale Seaweed Farming at Nearshore Exposed Sites via User-Focused Design Process

Adam T. St-Gelais<sup>1+†</sup>, David W. Fredriksson<sup>2</sup>, Tobias Dewhurst<sup>3</sup>, Zachary S. Miller-Hope<sup>1</sup>, Barry Antonio Costa-Pierce<sup>1†</sup> and Kathryn Johndrow<sup>1†</sup>

# FINAL COMMENTS RECOMMENDATIONS

Seaweeds as a precious diverse gift to Humanity. Seaweeds are Treasures. They are not Trash.

### Seaweeds are *not easy*.

"You better know their biology, ecology, physiology, biochemistry, etc. before trying to cultivate them".

Seaweeds *can be integrated* with many aquaculture, agriculture and treatment systems

Seaweeds can have major roles in carbon & nitrogen absorption TRANSFORMATION...NOT SEQUESTRATION

Seaweeds have tremendous potential in human health, agriculture (food Productio in general) and rural economic development. *Replace Your Imports! Scale Out! Benefit Your Fishermen/Farmers!* 



Seaweed biomass

Chopin et al. (2024)

Value (USD/kg DW)



A Guide to Cooking with POWER-PACKED SEAWEED

BARTON SEAVER

NORE THAN 75 DELICIOUS RECIPES FOR OPTIMAL HEALTH

OMEGA-35 O GALCIUM / PROTEIN . FIBER IODINE















## SEAFARM

https://nordicseafarm.com/



## Foods Biomaterials Animal feeds Fertilizers





## EU-funded project SEABIOPLAS

### Seaweeds from sustainable aquaculture as feedstock for biodegradable bioplastics



More Opportunities

- Genetic Improvement NIBIO Norway
- Systems Ecology Fisheries/Aquaculture Social Ecological Systems





## Aquaculture

# Fishery??











# **CELEBRATE!**



